Should Every Embryo be Screened or Frozen? What does the evidence say?





Richard T. Scott, Jr, MD, HCLD Clinical and Scientific Director, Reproductive Medicine Associates of New Jersey Professor and Director, Reproductive Endocrinology Robert Wood Johnson Medical School, Rutgers University

Contemporary Understanding of Maternal Age and Human Embryonic Aneuploidy



Franasiak et al – Fertil Steril 2014

Is transferring an aneuploid embryo clinically useful?



What are the "Burdens" of CCS



Thus the real questions are:

- 1. Safely attaining embryonic DNA
- 2. Predictive values of the techniques
- 3. Proportion of euploid embryos that will fail
- 4. Cost effectiveness

Some Disagree with PGS

Human Reproduction, Vol.29, No.9 pp. 1846-1850, 2014

Advanced Access publication on July 8, 2014 doi:10.1093/humrep/deu163

human reproduction

OPINION

Preimplantation genetic screening: back to the future

Sebastiaan Mastenbroek* and Sjoerd Repping

Center for Reproductive Medicine, Academic Medical Center, University of Amsterdam, Q3-119, Meibergdreef 9, 1105 AZ, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

*Correspondence address. E-mail: s.mastenbroek@amc.uva.nl

Submitted on April 1, 2014; resubmitted on May 9, 2014; accepted on June 3, 2014

Human Reproduction, Vol.29, No.9 pp. 1846-1850, 2014

Advanced Access publication on July 8, 2014 doi:10.1093/humrep/deu163



- All embryo selection techniques are detrimental
- Inappropriate to use "Implantation Rates" as an endpoint
- "it can be questioned whether all patients will ever be able to understand all of the complexities concerning PGS"
- "cost-effectiveness is being forgotten"
- "evidence is now accumulating that all embryos in an IVF cycle can be cryopreserved and transferred in subsequent cycles without impairing, and maybe even improving, the cumulative pregnancy rate of that IVF cycle"
- Embryo selection should therefore not be used to select out embryos, but only to determine the order in which the embryos will be transferred, as the time to pregnancy can be improved by embryo selection, if embryos with the highest implantation potential are transferred first.
- Culturing to the blastocyst may be harmful

Does Embryo Biopsy Impact the Developmental Potential of the Oocyte

Routine IVF Care through Retrieval



Identify mature oocytes

ICSI, culture, and select 2 best embryos for transfer

Transfer the embryos



Cell submitted for eventual aneuploidy screening and fingerprinting

One embryo randomized to

undergo biopsy

Implantation, Maternal serum sampling for free fetal DNA and Fingerprinting

N=113 pairs; 226 embryos

Overall implantation rates



27%) mean maternal age 32) reported by Gutierrez-Mateo, C., et al. Fertility and sterility 92, 1544-1556 (2009)

Is knowing the predictive value of a normal result sufficient?



Sherman et al 95:429-36 J Natl Cancer Inst (2003)

ORIGINAL ARTICLES: ASSISTED REPRODUCTION

Comprehensive chromosome screening is highly predictive of the reproductive potential of human embryos: a prospective, blinded, nonselection study

Richard T. Scott Jr., M.D., ^{a,b} Kathleen Ferry, B.S., ^a Jing Su, M.S., ^a Xin Tao, M.S., ^a Katherine Scott, M.S., ^a and Nathan R. Treff, Ph.D. ^{a,b}

^a Reproductive Medicine Associates of New Jersey, Morristown, New Jersey; and ^b Division of Reproductive Endocrinology, Department of Obstetrics Gynecology and Reproductive Science, University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey–Robert Wood Johnson Medical School, New Brunswick, New Jersey

With greater experience, actual negative predictive value is ~98.8%



Scott et al Fertil Steril 2012; 97:870-5

To have the opportunity for meaningful improvement, when you select for one criteria you most commonly deselect for another....

> Transfer Based on Embryo Morphology

Abnl	Abnl	NI	Abnl	NI	NI
			C	CCS changes t	he embryo
Transfer Based on			S	elected	, i
Aneuploidy Screening and			Z	40% of the time	
Embryo Morphology			F	Forman et al ASRM 2012	



METHODOLOGY

Open Access

Selection of single blastocysts for fresh transfer via standard morphology assessment alone and with array CGH for good prognosis IVF patients: results from a randomized pilot study

Zhihong Yang¹, Jiaen Liu², Gary S Collins³, Shala A Salem¹, Xiaohong Liu², Sarah S Lyle¹, Alison C Peck¹, E Scott Sills^{1*} and Rifaat D Salem¹

Table 3 Comparison of laboratory findings and clinical outcome among IVF patients undergoing SET with embryo assessment by aCGH + morphology (Group A) and blastocyst morphology alone (Group B)

	Α	В	p
Fresh blastocyst transfer according to morphology assessment:	55 (100)	48 (100)	
Grade 5/6	31 (56.4)	28 (58.3)	
Grade 4	21 (38.2)	19 (39.6)	0.677 ^a
Grade 3	3 (5.4)	1 (2.1)	
Clinical pregnancy	39 (70.9)	22 (45.8)	0.017 ^a
Ongoing pregnancy (≥20wks GA)	38 (69.1)	20 (41.7)	0.009 ^a
Missed abortion	1 (2.6)	2 (9.1)	0.597 ^b

Notes: All data reported as n (%). SET = single embryo transfer; aCGH = array comparative genomic hybridization; GA = gestational age ^a by Chi-squared test ^b by Fisher's exact test.

Monosomy: Trisomy Ratio of 2

aCGH enhances delivery rates – an RCT

RCT

- Age
 - All < 35
 - Mean age of 31
- Sample Size
 - 55 aCGH
 - 48 control
- Significant improvement in outcomes
- Answers one of the four critical validation questions

Cleavage-stage biopsy significantly impairs human embryonic implantation potential while blastocyst biopsy does not: a randomized and paired clinical trial

Richard T. Scott Jr., M.D., ^{a,b} Kathleen M. Upham, B.S., ^a Eric J. Forman, M.D., ^b Tian Zhao, M.S., ^a and Nathan R. Treff, Ph.D. ^{a,b,c}

^a Reproductive Medicine Associates of New Jersey, Morristown; ^b Division of Reproductive Endocrinology, Department of Obstetrics, Gynecology, and Reproductive Sciences, Robert Wood Johnson Medical School, Rutgers University, New Brunswick; and ^c Department of Genetics, Rutgers-State University of New Jersey, Piscataway, New Jersey

Comprehensive chromosome screening alters traditional morphology-based embryo selection: a prospective study of 100 consecutive cycles of planned fresh euploid blastocyst transfer

Eric J. Forman, M.D., ^{a,b} Kathleen M. Upham, B.S., ^a Michael Cheng, B.S., ^a Tian Zhao, B.S., ^a Kathleen H. Hong, M.D., ^{a,b} Nathan R. Treff, Ph.D., ^{a,b} and Richard T. Scott Jr., M.D. ^{a,b}

^a Reproductive Medicine Associates of New Jersey, Department of Reproductive Endocrinology, Basking Ridge; and ^b University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey–Robert Wood Johnson Medical School, Department of Obstetrics, Gynecology & Reproductive Sciences, New Brunswick, New Jersey

ORIGINAL ARTICLES: ASSISTED REPRODUCTION

Blastocyst biopsy with comprehensive chromosome screening and fresh embryo transfer significantly increases in vitro fertilization implantation and delivery rates: a randomized controlled trial

Richard T. Scott Jr., M.D., ^{a,b} Kathleen M. Upham, B.S.,^a Eric J. Forman, M.D., ^b Kathleen H. Hong, M.D., ^b Katherine L. Scott, M.S., ^{a,c} Deanne Taylor, Ph.D., ^{a,b} Xin Tao, M.S., ^a and Nathan R. Treff, Ph.D. ^{a,b}

^a Reproductive Medicine Associates of New Jersey, Morristown, New Jersey, ^b Division of Reproductive Endocrinology, Department of Obstetrics, Gynecology, and Reproductive Science, Robert Wood Johnson Medical School, Rutgers University, New Brunswick, New Jersey; and ^c Atlantic Reproductive Medicine Specialists, Raleigh, North Carolina



Scott et al Fertility and Sterility 2013; 100:697-703

The No Transfer Rate with CCS



Franasiak et al – Fertil Steril 2014

How Many Embryos Do Patient Undergoing CCS Have?



Trisomy: Monosomy Ratio by Age



Key Indicator for QA of your assay

Franasiak et al – Fertil Steril 2014

Clinical Experience Misdiagnoses

Clinical Error RatePer embryo0.2%Per transfer0.3%Per ongoing pregnancy0.1%

• 4974 embryos

3168 transfers

- 2976 gestations (62.1%)
- 10 errors
 - 1 tetraploid
 - 2 monosomies
 - 7 trisomies

- 2354 ongoing / delivered (72.1%)
- Mean age 38.4 years
- 10 errors
 - 7 found in losses
 - 3 found in ongoing preg.

Mosaicism evaluated in 4 samples – 100% mosaic

Consolidated Pregnancy Outcomes Proportion of All Pregnancies



Scott KL et al – RMA

PGS Improves but Does Not Normalize Implantation and Delivery Rates in Older Women



The NEW ENGLAND JOURNAL of MEDICINE

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Fertility Treatments and Multiple Births in the United States



Kulkarni D et al, New Engl J Med, 2014. PMID: 24304051

The NEW ENGLAND JOURNAL of MEDICINE

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Fertility Treatments and Multiple Births in the United States



Kulkarni D et al, New Engl J Med, 2014. PMID: 24304051

Singleton Term Delivery: The Ideal IVF Outcome

- IVF twin pregnancies are at an increased risk of: — Preeclampsia (2-fold risk increase)¹
 - Extreme prematurity (7.4-fold increase delivery <32 wks)²
 - NICU admission (3.8-fold increased risk)²
 Perinatal Death (2-fold increase)²
- Two IVF singleton deliveries have better obstetrical outcomes than one IVF twin delivery³
 - 1. ASRM Practice Committee, *Fertil Steril*, 2012. PMID: 22192352
 - 2. Pinborg A, et al., Acta Obstet Gynecol Scand, 2004. PMID: 15488125
 - 3. Sazonova A ,et al., Fertil Steril, 2013. PMID: 23219009

The Perception that Patients Love Multiples if They are Born Healthy is not Well Validated



Provided by a patient...

With >2 blastocysts, even patients at high aneuploidy risk are very likely to have a euploid blastocyst



FRESH SET RESULTS IN LOWER DELIVERY RATES THAN DOUBLE EMBRYO TRANSFER (DET)



- Cochrane Review of 6 randomized trials from 1999-2006 (N = 1,257)
- Young, good prognosis patients with "top quality" embryos available
- Slightly more singletons after DET

Pandian Z et al., *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2009. PMID: 19370588

The Dropout Rate from IVF is Significant



Source: Schroder AK: Cumulative pregnancy rates and drop out rates of a German IVF programme: 4, 102 cycles in 2,130 patients. RBM Online (2004) 8:600-606











CCS Results in Higher Implantation Rates



Implantation = cardiac activity at time of discharge to obstetrical care (~9 weeks)

Same Delivery Rate: Randomized Controlled Trial

Delivery Rate Per Patient (n=175)

Single euploid blastocyst transfer (N=89)
 Untested 2-blastocyst transfer (N=86)



Forman EJ et al. Fertil Steril 2013

Eliminates Multiples



Forman EJ et al. Fertil Steril 2013

Better Obstetrical Outcomes are Attained CCS/eSET than Conventional Two Embryo Transfer



Mean Birthweight: 3408 ± 562g – Single euploid 2745 ± 743g – 2-Blastocyst (P<0.001)
Low birthweight (<2,500g): 4.4% (2/45) – Single Euploid

4.4% (2/45) – Single Euploid 31.9% (22/69) – 2-Blastocyst (P<0.001)

Very low birthweight (<1,500g):
 0% (0/45) – Single Euploid
 7.2% (5/69) – 2-Blastocyst (P=0.06)

Ongoing Pregnancy Rates Fresh vs. Frozen Transfers



Obstetrical Costs for 100 Patients

Current Standard Of Care

Costs per Delivery*						
Singleton	\$21,458					
Twins	\$104,831					
Triplets	\$407,199					

Does not include:

- Pediatric costs after 28 days of age
- Disability costs during bed rest
- Loss of productivity in the work place

Lemos et al Am J Obstet Gynecol 2013; 209:586

Overall Cost to Provide Care CCS with SET versus Conventional Treatment

• Use actual cost data

- Inclusive of all IVF costs including
 - IVF cycle costs
 - CCS costs
 - Medication costs
- Delivery costs and subsequent hospital stay through 28 days of life



Do we ever recommend two embryo transfers?





Yes – but with caution...

CLINICAL RESEARCH OPPORTUNITY

SOLAIRE

SCREENING OF LOW RESPONDERS FOR ANEUPLOIDY TO IMPROVE REPRODUCTIVE EFFICIENCY

Time Lapse Observations in the Embryology Laboratory













And others.....







Time Lapse and Aneuploidy Traditional Markers



Hong KH et al – in review







Hong KH et al in review

Can Time Lapse Help Distinguish Which Euploid Blasts will Deliver from those Destined to Fail?



Temporal data evaluated:

- 5 conventional endpoints through cleavage stage
- Additional temporal endpoints from extended culture:
 - First compaction
 - Morula formation
 - First cavitation
 - Blastocyst Expansion
 - First contraction

NO: None of the 5 traditional parameters or 5 additional blast related parameters prognosticate outcome

neygen Next Generation Sequencing FOR EMBRYO SELECTION

Next Generation Sequencing Aligned Results





NextGen Sequencing Chip



NextGen Molecular Barcoding → Reduced Costs









NextGen Sequencing Chip



96 or more...

NextGen Sequencing Chip



\$\$\$\$\$/96

WGS (16 per chip)



WGS (48 per chip)



unpublished data

chromosome



unpublished data

chromosome

Embryo calibration results



unpublished data

chromosome

Chromosome specific cutoffs



Embryonic Endometrial Synchrony



It take two.....

Embryonic-Endometrial Asynchrony Increases with Maternal Age



Shapiro BS et al Fertil Steril 2013 100:S287

- Retrospective
- 1,341 IVF cycles
- Thresholds for Asynchrony (either)
 - P >1.5 mg/mL on day of hCG
 - No blastulation prior to day 6
- Risk for asynchrony increases with maternal age
- Live birth predicted
 - Day 5 blastulation (P<0.0001)
 - P < 1.5 ng/mL (P=0.0002)

Is it asynchrony or an intrinsic diminution in quality?

Late follicular rise in progesterone

- Retrospective study
- 4032 patients
- P₄ ≥1.5ng/mL associated with lower ongoing pregnancy rates



Progesterone and the Endometrial Transcriptome



Adapted from S. Young, MD, PhD

Progesterone Pharmacokinetics



Progesterone and the Endometrial Transcriptome

Number of genes differentially expressed vs. 40 mg P

	Natural Cycle	10 mg P	5 mg P	2.5 mg P
≥ 2-fold change	0	0	70	236
≥ 1.5-fold change	0	0	605	1186

Young Lab, Unpublished

Adapted from S. Young, MD, PhD

Progesterone and Impaired Implantation: A Pilot Study of Euploid Embryos



All patients had normal P levels prior to the administration of hCG

Beware of Interference in your P Assay



- Patients receiving DHEA have elevated DHEA-SO₄ levels
- These levels may falsely elevate P levels
- Assay dependent

Forman - RMANJ

Natural Cycle



embryo and endometrium synchrony - *revisited*



Fresh day 5 embryo transfer



Fresh day 6 embryo transfer



Frozen synchronous cycle



Older patients are more likely to have "slow" embryos



Forman et al ASRM 2013

Frozen day 6 embryo transfer



Obstetrical Outcomes Following Fresh versus Cryopreserved Embryo Transfer



PTB LBW SGA LGA ≥4500 Postterm

• Fresh embryos at increased risk for

- Preterm birth
- Low birth weight
- Small for gestational age

Wennerholm et al Hum Reprod 2013 28:2545-53

The supraphysiologic milieu which accompanies superovulation impact low birth weight risk



- Retrospective review of SART data
- 2004-2006
- 56,792 neonates
- Fresh embryo transfer at increased risk for LBW

The RMA New Jersey Team

Clinical Embryology Kathleen Upham Xinying Li Rosanna Pangasnan Tian Zhao **Michael Cheng** Hokyung Lee Ayesha Winslow Angela Romaniello Stephanie Milne Sarah Dunn Lauren Rary **Kristen Pauley Desiree** Greene Serhan Ozensoy Erin Dubell Susan Ng Maria Morel Jessica Wall

UTGERS

Robert Wood Johnson Medical School

<u>Clinical Research</u> Christine Reda Talia Metzgar Jennifer Tyler

Support Andrew Ruiz Nancy Niemaseck RMANJ Nurses





Physicians Paul Bergh Michael Bohrer Maria Costantini Michael Drews Fric Forman Rita Gulati Doreen Hock Kathleen Hong Thomas Kim Marcy Maguire **Thomas Molinaro** Jamie Morris Eli Rybak Wendy Schillings Shefali Shastri

<u>Fellows</u> Marie Werner Jason Franasiak Caroline Juneau The Source for New Beginnings Reproductive Medicine Associates of New Jerss

> <u>FAEEC</u> Rebekah Zimmerman Brynn Levy Lindsey McBain Heather Garnsey Andrew Behrens Sylvia Kloskowski Erica Vuu

The Treff Laboratory Nathan Treff Xin Tao Agnes Lonczak David Gabriele Chelsea Bohrer Tori Gartmond Margaret Lebiedzinski Oksana Bendarsky Mariya Rozov Anna Czyrsznic Kay Green, MD Meir Olcha, MD David Goodrich

> Bioinformatics Deanne Taylor Jessica Landis Yuanchao Zhang



